



Historic District Commission Minutes

Thursday, January 25, 2024
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 205
1315 S Washington Avenue
Saginaw, MI 48601
989-754-8222

I. Call to Order - Commissioner Mixter called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm.

II. Roll Call – Staff took roll.

Members Present: Lee Amo, Alex Mixter, Steven Meyers, Andrew Naumann and Kevin Mark Rooker

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Cassi Zimmerman, Robert Gollin, Attorney Amy Lusk

III. Approval of Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo, to approve the December 28, 2023, meeting minutes. **5 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

IV. Approval of Agenda

Motion by Commissioner Amo, seconded by Commissioner Rooker, to move item c. J24-0373 up to first on the agenda under New Business. **5 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.** Motion by Commissioner Meyers, seconded by Commissioner Rooker, to approve the modified agenda. **5 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

V. Public Comment

No Public Comment.

VI. New Business

a. J24-0373 HDC App 1021 Court St. Porch floor replacement

Sheryl Gregory, 1021 Court Street, Saginaw, MI described the proposed project and stated that the contractor agreed to do the lead paint abatement and cleanup of the site. She added that they, the owners, were removing the railings and the contractor was responsible only for the deck replacement and paint.

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for a proposed porch floor replacement and to paint the floor Covered Bridge Color (RGB: 104, 63, 61), at 1021 Court Street. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

Standard #6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of distinctive features, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible,

materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

5 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

b. J24 0364 HDC App 122 S Hamilton Ramp and Enclosure

A presentation of the project was presented by Nicholas Seehafer and Josh Duby, Shaheen Development, 1100 S Washington Ave, Saginaw, MI. Commissioner Rooker sought clarification on the construction of the ramp. Mr. Seehafer responded that it is proposed as cast in place concrete with a metal railing. Commissioner Meyers suggested that the face of the ramp be bricked and painted to match the exterior of the building. Mr. Seehafer agreed.

Motion by Commissioner Meyers, seconded by Commissioner Rooker, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for a proposed Ramp and Enclosure at 122 S Hamilton Street, contingent upon exterior of the ramp and enclosure to be bricked and painted to match the existing building. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

Standard #9: New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy the historical materials that characterize the property, The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

5 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

c. J24 0366 HDC App 303 Adams – Demo

A presentation of the proposed project was presented by Nicholas Seehafer, Shaheen Development, 1100 S Washington Ave, Saginaw, MI. They are requesting that 303 Adams be demolished to make way for the construction of a new 95,000 sq ft, 52-unit apartment building with underground parking and 4,000 sq ft of retail space. The building would be 4 stories.

Commissioner Rooker asked why the existing building isn't being considered. Mr. Seehafer responded that the configuration does not permit the densities needed to make it financially viable. Commissioner Mixter asked if the project has been through the Planning Commission for approvals. Mr. Seehafer responded that they needed approval by the HDC before moving forward. Commissioner Mixter responded that the guidelines state these approvals are part of the decision-making process. City Attorney Lusk stated that the NTP could be granted contingent upon the Planning Commission approvals. She added that the Planning Commission approval requirement is tied only to the standard that the "resource is a deterrent to a major improvement program that will be of substantial benefit to the community and the applicant" and the other standards for demolition approval do not contain that requirement. Mr. Seehafer stated that it would be a waste of time and money to go through the site plan review process only to have the demolition be rejected by the HDC.

Commissioner Amo stated that the area is a warehouse district, and this building may contribute to its character. Commissioner Nauman stated that he would like to see these historic buildings preserved, but, if it is not feasible, they will continue to sit vacant. Commissioner Mixter pointed out that the application is not complete without Planning Commission approval.

Motion by Commissioner Nauman, seconded by Commissioner Meyers, to issue a Notice to Proceed for case J24-0366 to demolish 303 Adams. The work is not appropriate; however, the following conditions prevail: *Standard b. The resource is a deterrent to a major improvement program that will be of substantial benefit to the community and the applicant proposing the work has obtained all the necessary planning and zoning approvals,*

financing, and environmental clearances.

A roll call vote was held. 3 ayes (Myers, Nauman, and Rooker), 2 nays (Mixer and Amo), 0 absent. Motion approved.

d. 2024 Meeting Calendar

Motion by Commissioner Amo, seconded by Commissioner Rooker, to approve the 2024 Meeting Calendar. **5 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

VII. Old Business

a. 2024 Goals

Commissioner Mixer reviewed the 1st quarter goals. He stated that the study committees are meeting on a regular basis to complete the current studies. Commissioner Rooker added that the Certified Local Government Annual Report is nearly complete and will be sent to the State next month.

Commissioner Mixer noted that he has two applicants to fill the vacancies on the HDC. They will be submitting applications to the clerk's office to be considered.

Commissioner Mixer, in reference to additional historic assets that should be studied, made a motion to put in place a moratorium on all demolitions of any historic property - whether in a local historic district or simply on the national register (all properties listed as historic in the master plan). He felt that the HDC needed more time to study these areas and to prevent demolitions during this time. No second was made. City Attorney Lusk requested that time be given to staff to research whether such a motion was appropriate and within the authority of the Historic District Commission; an opinion will be provided prior to the February meeting.

Motion by Commissioner Mixer, supported by Commissioner Rooker, to direct staff to produce a resolution to establish a study committee for the East Saginaw Historic Business District. **5 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

VIII. Adjournment

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo, to adjourn the meeting at 5:28 p.m. **5 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**