



City Planning Commission
1315 S Washington Avenue
Council Chambers – Room 205
989-754-8222

Minutes

Tuesday, April 23, 2024

- I. **Call to Order** – Commissioner Milne called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.
- II. **Roll Call** – Cassi Zimmerman took roll.
Present: Yolanda Bland, Michael Foust, Floyd Kloc, Carla LaMarr, John Milne, Brenda Moore, Jack Nash, William Ostash
Absent: Charlene Orange
Staff: Bob Gollin, Cassi Zimmerman, City Attorney Amy Lusk
- III. **Approval of Minutes** – March 26, 2024

Motion by Commissioner Kloc, seconded by Commissioner Ostash to approve the meeting minutes for the March 26, 2024, meeting. 8 ayes, 0 nays, 1 absent. Motion approved.
- IV. **Approval of Agenda**

Motion by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Nash to approve the amended agenda for the April 23, 2024, meeting. 8 ayes, 0 nays, 1 absent. Motion approved.

Commissioner Orange joined the meeting at 6:03 pm
- V. **New Business**
 - a. **J24-1547 - Site Plan Review for 108 N Niagara Street.**

Nicholas Seehafer, Shaheen Development Company, Saginaw, MI, presented a proposed project to demolish the existing building at 108 N Niagara Street and construct a new 20,016 sq ft, 3-story, 12-unit residential development in its place. The building would contain a 14-space parking garage on the ground floor level. The additional required parking would be provided by the City owned public parking on Hamilton Street.

Commissioner Kloc inquired about the location of additional parking. Mr. Seehafer pointed out that additional parking would be provided within the City public parking lot off N Hamilton Street which is permitted by the zoning ordinance. Commissioner LaMarr inquired about the timeframe for the project. Mr. Seehafer stated that Shaheen Development is working on another project at 303 Adams Street and plan to start this project after that if there is market demand. Commissioner LaMarr asked if there were any concerns about the location of the project to the City pump station. Mr. Seehafer said that the city engineering is aware of the project. He pointed out that the City plans to upgrade the CSO area on Niagara.

Commissioner Milne asked if the plan would be to salvage some of the historic features. Mr. Seehafer stated that they will salvage whatever historic features are salvageable and often use those items on other buildings that they own. Commissioner Kloc asked about the status of the floodplain. Mr. Seehafer stated that the intent is to apply to EGLE for a floodplain permit.

Motion by Commissioner LaMarr, seconded by Commissioner Moore to recommend the approval of the site plan contingent upon the following: 1) issuance of floodplain permit by EGLE; 2) issuance of a Notice to Proceed by the Saginaw Historic District Commission; and 3) review and approval by Saginaw Engineering Department. 9 ayes, 0 nays, none absent. Motion approved.
 - b. **J24-1551 – Site Plan Review – Delta Steel, 1410 Webber.**

John Morey, D&M Sites, Carrollton, MI, presented the project. He explained that the project includes a 10,395 sf and 1,350 sf addition on the existing fabricating building and a small 1,800 sf building for their priming operation. In addition, there will be a 24-space parking lot. Brian Swedorski, Architect for Pumford Construction, Kochville Twp., was also present and spoke about the construction process that included demolishing a small portion of the existing building to make way for the expansion on the west for the fabrication area.

Commissioner Moore asked about the completion date of the project. Mr. Swedorski responded that it would be about 8 months till completed. Commissioner Foust asked if there would be any additional employees hired. Mr. Swedorski stated that he thought it was 7-10 new employees.

Motion by Commissioner Kloc, seconded by Commissioner Moore to recommend the approved site plan contingent upon review and approval by Saginaw Engineering Department. 9 ayes, 0 nays, none absent. Motion approved.

c. Public Hearing - Proposed Short-Term Rental Ordinance.

Chairman Milne open the public hearing for the proposed Short-Term Rental Ordinance. Staff Gollin pointed out this topic has been discussed throughout the State. There is currently consideration by the Michigan State legislature to include provisions for communities to adopt regulations regarding short-term rentals.

Commissioner Orange asked where within the City would these short-term rentals be allowed. Staff Zimmerman responded that at this time they are permitted in the multi-family residential zones and most of the Riverfront Mixed Use areas. Commissioner Orange felt that these should be permitted in single family residential zoned areas. Commissioner Foust inquired about the 10-person limit. Staff Gollin stated that many ordinances throughout the State have that limit. The purpose is to prevent the use of those units as "party houses".

There was no one present in the audience to comment during the public hearing.

Motion by Commissioner Kloc, seconded by Commissioner Moore to close the public hearing. 9 ayes, 0 nays, none absent. Motion approved.

Motion by Commissioner Kloc, seconded by Commissioner Moore to approve and recommend to the City Council the proposed zoning ordinance amendment to include short-term rental units for consideration.

Commissioner Orange expressed her opinion that the ordinance should include the single and two family residential zoned areas of the City. She felt that it excludes individuals who own their home or who want to purchase a home to rent them out on a short-term basis. It limits their ability to generate income for themselves. Commissioner Foust commented that during his tenure in the City, the number one complaint from residence had to do with those who were running short-term rentals in their neighborhood. They felt they were not familiar with change-over of people coming and going into the neighborhood. They wanted to know their neighborhood. Commissioner Moore added that she also receives these types of complaints. She suggested that this ordinance is a good starting point and could be added to it in the future. Commissioner Kloc agreed and said that this ordinance defines the areas that these are permitted in, which is not the case currently.

Chairman Milne commented that having these within the multi-family districts typically offers sufficient parking. The single-family areas typically do not offer enough parking. Commissioner Kloc added that the ordinance provides for owner and nonowner-occupied homes. He felt that allowing non-owner-occupied short-term rentals is not a good idea for single family homes because the owner does not monitor the property. Commissioner Nash stated that there is an

appearance that it is discriminatory. Staff Gollin stated that the City is a zoned community which limits the different types of uses permitted within the City. It may appear discriminatory but seeks to prevent incompatible uses.

8 ayes, 1 nay, none absent. Motion approved.

d. Roethke House Historic District Study Committee Report.

Staff Gollin pointed out that the Historic District Study Committee is required to submit their findings to the Planning Commission for comment. No action is required except to forward any comments to the Committee.

Motion by Commissioner Kloc, seconded by Commissioner Moore to receive and file the report as submitted. 9 ayes, 0 nays, none absent. Motion approved.

VI. Public Comment - None

VIII. Old Business -

Staff Gollin encouraged all the Commission members to participate in the survey that is listed on the website regarding the zoning ordinance rewrite. It will provide some guidance in prioritizing the direction to move forward.

Commissioner LaMarr commented that she read the Roethke House Historic District Study report and felt that there was a lot of effort put into the report and they should be commended. Chair Milne offered to write a letter thanking them.

IX. Adjournment

Motion by Commissioner Moore, seconded by Commissioner Nash to adjourn the meeting at 7:09p.m. 9 ayes, 0 nays, none absent. Motion approved.

Prepared and submitted by

Robert Gollin
Urban Planner
City of Saginaw