



City of Saginaw
Historic District Commission
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 205
1315 S Washington Avenue
Saginaw, MI 48601
989-754-8222

Minutes
Thursday, December 19, 2024

I. Call to Order - Commissioner Amo called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm.

II. Roll Call – Staff took roll.

Members Present: Lee Amo, Kevin Jones, Andrew Nauman and Kevin Rooker

Members Absent: Mark Greskowiak, Alex Mixter, and Tom Raines

Staff Present: Robert Gollin, Cassi Zimmerman, Marcus Owens, & Attorney Amy Lusk

III. Approval of Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Jones, supported by Commissioner Rooker, to approve the Thursday, September 26, 2024, meeting minutes. **4 ayes, 0 nays, 3 absent. Motion approved.**

IV. Approval of Agenda

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, supported by Commissioner Jones, to approve the agenda as presented. **4 ayes, 0 nays, 3 absent. Motion approved.**

V. Public Comment

No Public Comment.

VI. New Business

- a. J24-2809 Porch replacement 815 Adams St.** The applicant was not in attendance to present the project. Commissioner Rooker stated that the proposed work does not meet the Secretary of Interior standards.

Commissioner Rooker made a motion, supported by Commissioner Jones to deny the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for J24-2809 because the work fails to meet the following Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved, and

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of distinctive features, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Nauman inquired if the applicant could come back with a modification to meet the standards. Commissioner Rooker stated that they could come back.

4 ayes, 0 nays, 3 absent. Motion approved.

- b. J24-2912 New detached 18 x 24 garage, rear porch/breezeway and window replacement- 820 Adams St.** Kiki Wallace, 820 Adams Street, described the project with the intent to restore the property and construct a new garage. Commissioner Amo

asked if the windows had been chosen. She explained that those would need to be submitted for approval along with the color. Commissioner Rooker commented that the proposed garage looks appropriate for the lot and consistent with the architecture.

Commissioner Rooker made a motion, supported by Commissioner Nauman, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for J24-2912 because the work meets the following Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved, and

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of distinctive features, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

Commissioner Rooker made a motion to amend the original motion, supported by Commissioner Jones, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness contingent upon the applicant bringing back to the Commission the proposed windows and garage door for approval. **4 ayes, 0 nays, 3 absent. Motion approved**

The commission then considered the original motion.

4 ayes, 0 nays, 3 absent. Motion approved

c. J24-2813 Installation of vinyl siding, new windows and trim – 417 S Granger St.

Timothy Wolverton, 417 S Granger Street, Saginaw described the project.

Commissioner Rooker pointed out that the vinyl siding will cause the windows to look recessed due to the way it is installed. The windows need to be flush with the siding. This does not meet the Secretary of Interior guidelines. He also pointed out that the bay window replacement causes some of the current details to be lost. Commissioner Jones asked if the applicant would want to make changes and come back. Mr. Wolverton responded that the cost is prohibitive.

A motion by Commissioner Rooker was made, supported by Commissioner Nauman, to deny the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for J24-2813 because the work fails to meet the following Secretary of Interior Standards for rehabilitation:

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved, and

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of distinctive features, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

4 ayes, 0 nays, 3 absent. Motion approved

- d. Proposed 2025 Meeting Calendar.** Motion was made by Commissioner Rooker, supported by Commissioner Jones to approve the 2025 Meeting Calendar.
4 ayes, 0 nays, 3 absent. Motion approved

VII. Old Business

Commissioner Rooker explained that the study committee for the Berringer Building is nearly complete.

VIII. Adjournment

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Nauman, to adjourn the meeting at 5:13 p.m. **4 ayes, 0 nays, 3 absent. Motion approved**

Respectfully submitted.
Robert Gollin, Staff