



City of Saginaw
Historic District Commission
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 205
1315 S Washington Avenue
Saginaw, MI 48601
989-754-8222
Minutes
Thursday, June 27, 2024

I. Call to Order - Commissioner Mixter called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm.

II. Roll Call – Staff took roll.

Members Present: Lee Amo, Nathan Hanley, Kevin Jones, Alex Mixter, Andrew Naumann and Kevin Mark Rooker

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Cassi Zimmerman, Robert Gollin, Attorney Amy Lusk

III. Approval of Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Amo, seconded by Commissioner Hanley, to approve the April 25, 2024, meeting minutes. **6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

IV. Approval of Agenda

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo, to approve the agenda. **6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo, to recess meeting to conduct the public hearing. **6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

V. Public Hearing – Roethke Homes Historic District Report.

Public hearing regarding the report to establish the Roethke Homes Historic District was opened by Commissioner Mixter.

Roethke Historic District Study Committee Members present: Kevin Rooker, Lee Amo, Steven Meyers

Alex de Parry, 413 Adams Street and Sharon Francis, 1805 Gratiot, members of the Friends of Theodore Roethke Foundation thanked the committee for assembling the report and spoke in favor of establishing the historic district.

Study Committee member Rooker made a motion, seconded by Committee member Meyers, to close the public hearing. **3 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

VI. Public Comment

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Hanley, reconvene the meeting and resume with the regular order of business. **6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

Commissioner Mixter opened the floor for public comment.

Russ Inman, 110 Braley Street, announced that the Lawn Chair Film Festival will be starting in July. He invited all to attend.

Alex de Parry, 413 Adams Street, spoke in support of the proposed development for 303 Adams Street and encouraged the HDC to approve the demolition of 218 S Hamilton. He

pointed out that it will increase the number of residents living within the area who will support the local businesses.

Bill Ostash, 1000 Hoyt Ave, Saginaw, offered support for 303 Adams Street project. He also spoke about the decision by the HDC to deny the request to demolish 108 N Niagara during last month's HDC meeting. He commented that the HDC represents the City of Saginaw and should focus on the buildings along Hamilton and N Michigan. He pointed out that 108 N Niagara poses a danger to the area because of its condition and location to critical infrastructure. The HDC should consider rescinding its decision.

VI. New Business

- a. **J24-2794 HDC Application Notice to Proceed – 218 S Hamilton Street.** Nick Seehafer, Shaheen Development, 1100 S Washington Ave, Saginaw, MI, described the proposed project. He explained that HDC approved the demolition of 303 Adams Street for the original project to move forward. However, a purchase agreement for the properties at 212 S Hamilton Street and 218 S Hamilton Street was secured, which has changed the proposed project to what is currently being presented. He is requesting that the Historic District Commission issue a Notice to Proceed, under criteria B, to demolish the building at 218 S Hamilton for this new project. Mr. Seehafer pointed out that he received a letter of support from the businesses of the Old Town Association with 4 pages of signatures.

Commissioner Handley asked if there is any provision to preserve the mural on the side of the building. Mr. Shaheen responded that they would be happy to explore options to preserve it and document it but will not make commitment to anything at this point. Commissioner Mixer asked if the mural on the opposite wall could be preserved. Mr. Seehafer stated that it is bolted onto the building and can be removed and can be retained for future display elsewhere.

Commissioner Mixer inquired about the retail space along S Hamilton. Mr. Seehafer responded that currently it is designed to have six separate entrances which could be combined. Pete Shaheen, Shaheen Development also pointed out that the Planning Commission has reviewed and approved the proposed site plan and it meets all of the zoning requirements.

Commissioner Rooker made a motion, supported by Commissioner Hanley, to issue a Notice to Proceed for application number J24-2794. The work is not appropriate; however, the following condition prevails: The site is a deterrent to a major improvement program that will be a large benefit to the community. **6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

- b. **J24-2796 HDC Application Exterior Alterations/Repairs - 301 Cass Avenue.** Russ Inman, 110 Braley Street, presented the project. He stated that there are three areas of work. They are proposing to remove the roof, restoring/replacing the timbers, and rebuilding the roof system. Area #1 they would be removing the structure, bracing the exterior brick walls, repair any brick work and remove the interior structure. Area #2 the plan is to remove the roof and restore any timbers and install a metal roof. Area #3 the brick wall in the back will need to be removed and rebuilt and capped.

Commissioner Hanley made a motion, supported by Commissioner Jones, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for application J24-2796. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

Standard #6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of distinctive features, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials.

Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

- c. **J24-2798 HDC Application Exterior Alterations/Repairs - 413 Adams St.** Betsy de Parry, 413 Adams Street, explained that the HDC previously approved the paint color for the walls along the east side of the building, rapping around to the wall of the garage with the mural. The wall with the mural required tuck pointing which has damaged the mural. The painter of the mural has been contacted and does not feel that the mural is worth restoring. The request is to paint over the mural with the approved Brattle Spruce G-1-1 paint.

Commissioner Mixter asked about the mural that was to be installed on the east wall that was previously approved by the HDC. Ms. de Parry responded that artist was trying to put it together, and it never transpired. Commissioner Jones asked if a mural could be painted on that wall. Ms. de Parry stated that they are open to having another mural painted. Commissioner Mixter commented that it seemed the artwork along this area is diminishing.

Commissioner Nauman made a motion, seconded by Handley, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for application J24-2798. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

Standard #5: Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved – Specifically Using the color Brattle Spruce G-1-1.

6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

- d. **J24-2797 HDC Application Exterior Alterations/Repairs – 100 S Hamilton (West Bank Lofts).** Alex de Parry, 413 Adams Street, presented the project. He stated that the tenants are looking for a private outdoor area to congregate. He is proposing a deck on the roof of the West Bank Lofts parking garage. This will be accessible from the inside and will require a door to be installed at the location of an existing window. The door will match the architectural features of the existing windows. He pointed out the door

Commissioner Amo asked if the deck will require a railing. Mr. de Parry explained the deck will include a 42" tall railing around it. He pointed out that the parapet wall is roughly 2 ft tall and will not be visible from the street. Commissioner Jones felt that the proposed roof top deck will lend itself to creating a more cohesive community amongst those residing in the lofts.

Commissioner Nauman made a motion, seconded by Handley, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for application J24-2798. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy the historical materials that characterize the property, The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment; and,

Standard 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

VII. Old Business

2024 Goals. Commissioner Mixter suggested that the Commission continue to work on updating the Historic District Map within the Master Plan to reflect all of the local historic

districts.

Commissioner Rooker made a motion, seconded by Commissioner Nauman, to rescind the previous denial of the motion, during the May 2024 meeting, to issue a Notice to Proceed for the demolition of 108 N Niagara. A roll call vote was taken: **2 ayes, 4 nays, 0 absent. Motion denied.**

VIII. Adjournment

Motion by Commissioner Amo, seconded by Commissioner Hanley, to adjourn the meeting at 5:31 p.m. **6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

Respectfully submitted.
Robert Gollin, Staff