



City of Saginaw
Historic District Commission
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 205
1315 S Washington Avenue
Saginaw, MI 48601
989-754-8222
Minutes
Tuesday March 28, 2024

I. Call to Order - Commissioner Mixer called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm.

II. Roll Call – Staff took roll.

Members Present: Lee Amo, Nathan Hanley, Kevin Jones, Alex Mixer, Steven Meyers, Andrew Naumann and Kevin Mark Rooker

Members Absent: None

Staff Present: Cassi Zimmerman, Robert Gollin, Attorney Amy Lusk

III. Approval of Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Meyers, seconded by Commissioner Rooker, to approve the February 20, 2024, meeting minutes. **7 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

IV. Approval of Agenda

Motion by Commissioner Amo, seconded by Commissioner Rooker, to approve the agenda as presented. **7 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

V. Public Comment

Russ Inman, 110 Braley St, Saginaw, invited all to an Easter Egg Hunt Saturday, March 30 in Old Town at the County building.

VI. New Business

a. J24-1414 – Replacement windows - 1102 Mackinaw Street

Staff Gollin pointed out that the request coincides with an application for an ARPA window replacement program. Commissioner Amo asked about the requirements and specifically if vinyl windows are being spec'd out. Staff Gollin stated that the program budgets \$10,000 per house and it is up to the contractor to install windows within the budget and within the scope of work. Commissioner Meyers asked if the scope of work would allow for repair. Staff Gollin responded that the specifications call out for new window replacement. He added that it was the City's Community Services group that is inquiring about approval for this project. If it is not approved, they will move on to another applicant.

Commissioner Mixer stated that the only window that looks original to the house appears to be the window in the gable end of the house. Commissioner Hanley asked if there was a time limit. Staff Gollin stated that the program grant approval process is slated for April and the applicant was preapproved for the roof program and decided on windows. Attorney Lusk added that the applicant may not have an official contract but has been found to meet the income guidelines and is awaiting approval by the Historic District Commission. A contractor would be awarded the contract to do the work.

Commissioner Mixer again pointed out the windows do not appear to be original to the house with some exceptions and are not a defining feature of the house. Commissioner Rooker stated that there is not enough information for the group to decide. He felt that it appears the existing windows appear to be modified.

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Hanley, to issue a Certificate

of Appropriateness for a proposed window replacement at 1102 Mackinaw St. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

Standard #6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of distinctive features, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence. The stipulation is that all the windows must match the existing size and style. **7 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

b. J24-1415 – Porch Reconstruction – 118 S Porter Street

Anna Leppart Largent, 915 Court St, Saginaw, reviewed the proposed project. She stated that the porch is near collapse and the contractor states that the roof structure of the porch will need to be replaced. The intent is to match the design. She stated that the colors approved by the HDC in 2023 will be used.

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Hanley, to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for a proposed porch reconstruction at 118 S Porter Street. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular:

Standards # 5: Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved; and,

Standard #6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of distinctive features, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence. The stipulation is that all the windows must match the existing size and style. **7 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

VII. Old Business

a. 2024 Goals

Commissioner Mixter pointed out that most of the 1st quarter goals have been accomplished. Commissioner Rooker stated that the Roethke Home Historic District Study has been submitted to SHPO and will likely need a public hearing in late summer. He added that the South Elementary School Historic District is under research. Attorney Lusk pointed out that staff needs the reports as well to make sure the public hearing process is followed. Commissioner Rooker explained that he will forward the report to staff, but the public hearing notice is not less than 60 days after transmittal to SHPO. The report will be forwarded to the Planning Commission at its next meeting.

Commissioner Mixter

VIII. Adjournment

Motion by Commissioner Meyers, seconded by Commissioner Rooker, to adjourn the meeting at 5:30 p.m. **7 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.**

Respectfully submitted.
Robert Gollin, Staff