



**Historic District Commission
Proposed Minutes**

Thursday, July 27, 2023
City Hall Council Chamber, Room 205
1315 S Washington Avenue
Saginaw, MI 48601
989-754-8222

I. Call to Order - Commissioner Mixter called the meeting to order at 4:30 pm.

II. Roll Call – Staff Zimmerman took roll.

Present: Lee Amo, Jordan Chambers, Darla Hane, Alex Mixter, Andrew Naumann,
Kevin Mark Rooker

Absent: None

Excused:

Staff Present: Bob Gollin; Cassi Zimmerman; City Attorney Amy Lusk

III. Approval of Minutes

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo to approve the June 22, 2023, meeting minutes. Motion approved.

IV. Approval of Agenda

Motion by Commissioner Chambers, seconded by Commissioner Nauman to approve agenda. Motion approved.

V. Public Comment

None

VI. New Business

a. J22-0192 – 406 Court Trim Color Approval

Tanisha Brooks, 4720 Eva Street, Saginaw, MI, gave a brief description of the proposed project. She stated that her first choice of color is black vs Brattled Spruce.

Commissioner Hane asked if black is a color offered in our palate. Commissioner Rooker stated that Black was used in that period. He suggested that the Historic District Commission consider adding it.

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #J23-0192 to authorize the use of the color Black for the trim on the upper story windows. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standard #2 “the historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved.

The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided;” and, #5 “Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or example of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved. 6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

b. J23-0193 – 123 N Franklin Street Mural

Jamie Forbes, Steering Committee Member of the Great Mural Project, requested approval of placing a mural on the 123 Franklin Street building, commonly known as the Berringer Building. She explained that the mural is a paired mural of one depicting Saginaw past. The proposed mural will be a depiction of Saginaw present. The mural will be painted on the south facing wall of the building that currently is painted and contains an existing mural. The design will be finalized in the next few weeks. The project will be completed early this fall. Commissioner Mixer asked if the existing mural will be painted over. Ms. Forbes responded in the affirmative.

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #J23-0193 to authorize the painting of a mural on the south side of the building at 123 N Franklin. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standard #2 “the historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided;” and, #5 “Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or example of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved. 6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

c. J23-0194 – 122 S Hamilton Street Façade Grant Improvements

Josh Duby, Construction Manager for Shaheen Development, 1100 S Washington Ave Suite 3, Saginaw, explained that the project involves freshening up the façade of the building with paint, replacing rotted wood and windows. Commissioner Amo asked about the accent detail above and below the windows and below the doors. Mr. Duby responded that the owners omitted the trim detail. He added that the windows will remain, but the glass will be replaced. Commissioner Amo asked about the back of the building. Mr. Duby stated that this was not part of the project. More discussion centered encouraging painting the back of the building and on the accent detail below the windows and doors.

Motion by Commissioner Amo, seconded by Commissioner Chambers to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #J23-0193 under the following conditions:

- 1. The details under the windows and the lower part of the doors be differentiated from the main body color;**
 - 2. Windows on the first floor retain their arch and the glass be replaced;**
 - 3. Doors remain wood and match existing doors;**
 - 4. Gutters need to match existing gutters; and,**
 - 5. The rear of the building be painted to match the front body of the building.**
- The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standard #9 “New additions, exterior alterations or related new construction shall not destroy the historical materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.**

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Chambers to amend the motion adding Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation #6 “Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the

severity of deterioration requires replacement of the distinctive features, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence;" #2 *"the historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided;"* and, #5 *"Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or example of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved."* 6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Amended Motion approved. 6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Original Motion approved.

d. J23-0195 – 808 N Michigan – Evacuation Stairs

Krystal Marshall and Brandi Hayes described the project involving adding an exterior evacuation stair to the second floor as required by the City of Saginaw Fire Marshal. The stairs will be constructed of metal and the color will be black. Commissioner Rooker confirmed that the stairs will be running east and west parallel to the building. He also inquired about the color of the door. Ms. Marshall responded that the door will be grey to match the existing door on the first floor. Commissioner Amo suggested that the brick being removed for the door be retained along with the window.

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Amo to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #J23-0195. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standard #10 "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired. 6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent.

e. J23-0196 – 111 N Hamilton – Paint, Window and Awning

Alex and Betsy de Parry presented the project. Commissioner Amo inquired if the awning extended along the face of the building. Betsy de Parry explained that awning does extend along the face of the building but includes the arched awning over the door to add dimension to the façade. She added that the color of the arched awning picks up the color from the adjacent alley and a window was added to bring light into the building.

Motion by Commissioner Amo, seconded by Commissioner Chambers to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for Case #J23-0196. The work as proposed meets the Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standard #2 *"the historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided;"* #5 *"Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or example of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved;"* and, #10 "New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired." 6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

VII. Old Business

a. 2023 Goals

Staff Zimmerman provided an update on Demolition by Neglect letters sent out. She stated that the city did receive a letter from Shaheen Development regarding 108 N Niagara, but it did not include an engineering report. A response was sent back requesting the report. Regarding the two buildings at 121 N Hamilton and 301 Cass, the report was due July 27.

Commissioner Amo requested copies of the COA's that get sent out.

b. Trim Color

Commissioner Chambers made a motion to add the trim color black to all the color systems excepting Color System A. 6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

VII. Adjournment

Motion by Commissioner Rooker, seconded by Commissioner Chambers to adjourn the meeting at 5.23 pm. 6 ayes, 0 nays, 0 absent. Motion approved.

Prepared and submitted by

Robert Gollin
Urban Planner
City of Saginaw